

Symptomatic nucleus of homeopathic remedies: remedies derived from carbon as case-study.

Luciana Costa Lima Thomaz

Associação Paulista de Homeopatia, SP, Brazil

ABSTRACT

Homeopathic clinical practice requires both accuracy and agility in diagnosis and prescription of treatment during real-time consultations. Several approaches have been attempted to facilitate this process including different criteria to group homeopathic remedies. This study sought to establish whether classification according to the chemical composition of substances used as basis of homeopathic remedies have correspondence in the experimental homeopathic materia medica.

Methods: The homeopathic remedies derived from carbon were selected as case-study. The experimental symptoms of these remedies were compared and a nucleus of symptoms common to all could be found. This nucleus was then compared to similarly obtained nuclei of experimental symptoms of homeopathic remedies derived from sulfur and phosphor to test qualitative specificity and finally to the traditionally described clinical picture of the so-called homeopathic carbonic constitution to establish whether the latter has homeopathic experimental grounds.

Results: a nucleus of experimental symptoms common to homeopathic remedies derived from carbon was found, qualitatively different from the symptomatic nuclei of homeopathic remedies derived from sulfur and phosphor; no correlation was found, however, with the clinical image of so-called carbonic constitution.

Keywords: Homeopathy; Materia Medica; Remedies; Classes; Carbon

Introduction

The homeopathic materia medica, namely, the compilation of homeopathic remedies and their effects on human beings is extremely large. For this reason, some methods and techniques have been suggested to facilitate the study of remedies as well as their selection in real-time consultations. The best known among them is known as “repertory” and consists in the reverse of the materia medica: symptoms are listed as in a dictionary according to topographical and alphabetical criteria, together with their corresponding remedies.

Another possibility is to resort to classifications of remedies. In this context, several authors have suggested different criteria to systematize the homeopathic materia medica. It can be said that the first to attempt this approach was Samuel Hahnemann, the founder of Homeopathy, who classified and listed remedies as “apsoric”, “antipsoric”, “antisycotic” and “antisiphilitic” [1]. This same approach was kept by later authors, as e.g. N. Ghatak [2].

Still other authors appealed to eclectic and singular approaches. For instance, Alfonso Masi-Elizalde essayed a systematization of remedies according to Aquinas’ description of Divine attributes, as represented in the latter’s *Summa Theologica* [3].

More recently, Rajan Sankaran typified remedies according to the properties of the three kingdoms of nature, viz. mineral (presenting chiefly disturbs of structure), vegetal (the accent falls on sensitiveness) and animal (survival, as main issue), as deriving from the periodic table of elements, botanical taxonomy, etc [4]. A similar approach, also emphasizing taxonomies has been suggested by Jan Scholten [5]. Both had a less known antecedent in the work of Otto Leeser, in the 1930s, who also employed the periodic table of elements as the basis for a study on salts grounded on experimental biochemistry [6].

In this context, mineral remedies have received particular attention, and classifications grounded on their chemical composition and possible physiological actions have been attempted since

the 19th century, as e.g. in the works of E. von Grauvogl and W.H. Schlüssler [7,8]. Inspired by these ideas, in the following century, Swiss homeopath Antoine Nebel correlated biochemical notions to endocrine functions, formulating in this way the notion of “homeopathic constitutions”. Léon Vannier continued the studies on such “constitutions”, while emphasizing the osteo-muscular structure of individuals, whereas Henri Bernard classified remedies and constitutions according to their correlation to the embryological layers and the biochemical structure of mineral remedies derived from salts [9-11].

An heir of this tradition, Roland Zissu, nevertheless, warns that correlations between homeopathic remedies derived from mineral salts and human constitutions can be confusing, as attempts to classify human types according to morphological, physiological and mental data have no direct relationship to either the principles of Homeopathy or the homeopathic remedies hypothetically related to such constitutions [12].

More recently, Bungetzianu and Jurj [13-15] introduced an approach to the study of the materia medica aiming at integrating homeopathic experimental data, on the one hand, and physiological and clinical information, on the other, by verifying whether there was correlation between the chemical composition of substances used as basis of homeopathic remedies and the corresponding homeopathic remedies, bridging in this way the gap between general medical and homeopathic knowledge.

Our study aimed to verify if there actually are symptomatic nuclei common to families or classes of homeopathic remedies as described in the experimental homeopathic materia medica, i.e. product of homeopathic pathogenetic trials, toxicological and clinical reports. On the one hand, this study would help to verify whether or not symptomatic nuclei can be related to biochemical, botanical, and other taxonomies or refute them. On the other, a positive result can contribute to clinical practice, by introducing delimitations in the field of pharmacological options, which would facilitate the selection of remedies in real-time consultations.

The present article presents the study of one class of homeopathic remedies, namely those derived from carbon compounds, designed to establish the possible existence of a symptomatic nucleus common to all of them.

Materials and Methods

The first step of this research sought to identify all remedies derived from carbon. To fulfill this goal,

digital repertory Synthesis 9 was used [16]. From this initial list of remedies, according to the purpose of this study, we selected those remedies which may be rated as the most representative, due to the number of corresponding symptoms. Inclusion of so-called “small remedies” – which present a small number of symptoms since they have not been sufficiently proved – would hinder on methodological grounds the identification of a possible common symptomatic nucleus of homeopathic remedies derived from carbon.

The next step was to perform a comparative extraction of the selected remedies, identifying in this ways all the symptoms common to all of them. As the outcome was positive and eighty symptoms were identified, we proceeded to an analysis of these symptoms in order to define the symptomatic nucleus common to homeopathic remedies derived from carbon.

To test the consistency of the symptomatic nucleus thus established, we performed a similar study with homeopathic remedies derived from sulfur and phosphor [16]. This is to say, we hypothesized that the symptomatic nucleus identified for homeopathic remedies derived from carbon might not be specific for that class if it were composed by exceedingly general symptoms, common to many other homeopathic remedies not derived from carbon. Comparison of the possible nucleus of homeopathic remedies derived from carbon to the possible symptomatic nuclei of homeopathic remedies derived from two major sources, namely phosphor and sulfur, would help to settle this issue.

Finally, we compared our results with homeopathic remedies derived from carbon – obtained by analysis of the experimental homeopathic materia medica – and traditional notions on so-called “carbonic constitution” together with the homeopathic remedies that hypothetically would represent them in order to establish whether they have some empirical foundation or are result of pure speculation. Sources employed were Bernard and Franco [10,11,17], as the former represents the traditional view on so-called homeopathic constitutions and the latter presents a comprehensive review and systematization of this notion.

Results

Remedies derived from carbon in the homeopathic materia medica

Remedies derived from carbon listed in the experimental homeopathic materia medica are described in Table 1.

Table 1. Remedies derived from carbon in the Materia Medica

Remedy	Composition
<i>Adamas</i>	Pure mineral carbon (diamond)
<i>Ammonium carbonicum</i>	Ammonium carbonate
<i>Baryta carbonica</i>	Barium carbonate
<i>Calcarea carbonica</i>	Calcium carbonate (oyster)
<i>Cuprum carbonicum</i>	Copper carbonate
<i>Ferrum carbonicum</i>	Iron carbonate
<i>Graphites</i>	Mineral carbon slightly mixed with iron
<i>Kalium carbonicum</i>	Potassium carbonate
<i>Magnesium carbonicum</i>	Magnesium carbonate
<i>Natrum carbonicum</i>	Sodium carbonate
<i>Strontium carbonicum</i>	Strontium carbonate
<i>Zincum carbonicum</i>	Zincum carbonate
<i>Carboneum</i>	Amorphous carbon
<i>Carboneum chloratum</i>	Carbon tetrachloride
<i>Carboneum hydrogenisatum</i>	Hydrogenated carbon
<i>Carboneum oxygenisatum</i>	Carbon monoxide
<i>Carboneum sulphuratum</i>	Carbon bisulphate

For comparison purposes, homeopathic remedies *Carbo vegetabilis* and *Carbo animalis* were excluded, as their sources are extremely complex organic materials. On the other hand, homeopathic remedies *Graphites* and *Adamas* were included in the comparison as they derive from native form of carbon. As it was stated above, minor salts were excluded, as also *Carboneum sulphuratum*, since its chemical composition (carbon and sulfur) intersects two main classes to be compared in this

study (homeopathic remedies derived from carbon and sulfur).

Remedies which thus fulfilled inclusion criteria were: *Adamas*, *Ammonium carbonicum* (*Am-c*), *Baryta carbonica* (*Bar-c*), *Calcarea carbonica* (*Calc*), *Graphites* (*Graph*), *Kalium carbonicum* (*Kali-c*), *Magnesium carbonicum* (*Mag-c*) and *Natrum carbonicum* (*Nat-c*). Symptoms common to all were extracted with the help of software Radar Brasil 9.2.1, results are presented in Table 2.

Table 2. Symptoms common to homeopathic remedies derived from carbon

Total	80
MIND - ABSENTMINDED	CHEST - PALPITATION of heart
MIND - ANGER	BACK - PAIN
MIND - ANXIETY	EXTREMITIES - HEAVINESS
MIND - CONCENTRATION - difficult	SLEEP - SLEEPINESS
MIND - CONFUSION of mind	SLEEP - WAKING - fright, as from
MIND - DULLNESS	DREAMS - AMOROUS
MIND - FORGETFUL	DREAMS - ANXIOUS
MIND - INDIFFERENCE	DREAMS - VIVID
MIND - IRRITABILITY	CHILL - CHILL in general
MIND - LAZINESS	CHILL - INTERNAL
MIND - MEMORY - weakness of memory	CHILL - SHAKING
MIND - MENTAL EXERTION - aversion to	SKIN - BURNING - scratching; after
MIND - MOROSE	SKIN - ITCHING
MIND - PROSTRATION of mind	SKIN - ITCHING - burning
MIND - QUARRELSOME	GENERALS - SIDE - right
MIND - SADNESS	GENERALS - SIDE - left
MIND - SENSITIVE - noise, to	GENERALS - AIR; IN OPEN - amel.
MIND - TACITURN	GENERALS - AIR; OPEN - desire for open air
MIND - TIMIDITY	GENERALS - COLD - air - agg.
VERTIGO - VERTIGO	GENERALS - COUGH - during - agg.
HEAD - HEAVINESS	GENERALS - DRYNESS of usually moist

HEAD - PAIN - Forehead EYE - PAIN EAR - NOISES in NOSE - CORYZA - cough - with NOSE - SMELL - acute FACE - DISCOLORATION - pale MOUTH – DISCOLORATION -Tongue - white MOUTH - DRYNESS MOUTH - SALIVATION - profuse THROAT - LUMP; sensation of a THROAT - PAIN - sore STOMACH - APPETITE - increased STOMACH - THIRST RECTUM - CONSTIPATION - difficult stool STOOL - HARD URETHRA - PAIN - urination – during - agg. - burning COUGH - LOOSE EXPECTORATION - YELLOW CHEST - OPPRESSION	internal parts GENERALS - EXERTION; physical - agg. GENERALS - HEAT – flushes of GENERALS - HEAT - lack of vital heat GENERALS - HEAT - sensation of GENERALS - HEAVINESS - Externally GENERALS - HEAVINESS – Internally GENERALS - LASSITUDE GENERALS - LYING - amel. GENERALS - MOTION - agg. GENERALS - OBESITY GENERALS - PAIN - pinching pain GENERALS - PAIN - sore GENERALS - PAIN - Internally - pressing pain GENERALS - PERIODICITY GENERALS - SWELLING - general; in GENERALS - WAKING - on GENERALS - WEAKNESS GENERALS - WEAKNESS - walking - agg. GENERALS – WEARINESS
---	---

Analysis of these 80 symptoms allowed us to identify a symptomatic nucleus common to homeopathic remedies derived from carbon, which is described as follows:

- On the mental level: distraction, difficulty to concentrate, weak memory, lack of motivation, apathy and indifference, with mental prostration and moroseness; aversion to mental effort and lassitude. Humor can be variable and changing, with an inclination for quarreling, sadness and timidity.
- Head: feeling of a weight, especially on the forehead.
- Eyes: pain.
- Ear: tinnitus.
- Nose: coryza with cough; sensitiveness to odors.
- Face: paleness.
- Mouth: dryness; paleness of the tongue; copious salivation.
- Throat: feeling of a lump.
- Chest: loose cough; yellowish expectoration; feeling of oppression; palpitations.
- Abdomen: increased appetite and thirst; constipation; hard stools.
- Genitals: increased sexual desire (women)
- Urinary: pain in the urethra during micturition
- Locomotor system: backache; heaviness of the limbs.
- Sleep: sleepiness; fright on waking.
- Dreams: amorous; anxious; vivid.
- Chills: chills and trembling by cold; internal trembling.
- Skin: burning itch.
- Temperature: desire for and amelioration by fresh air; aggravation by cold air; flushes of heat; lack of vital heat; feeling of heat.
- Modalities of aggravation: by cough; by physical effort; motion; upon waking up.
- Modalities of amelioration: lying down
- Sensations: of internal and external heaviness; lassitude; internal pressing pains; pains as by a wound; pain with feeling of tightness.
- Generals: obesity; periodicity of symptoms; swellings; weakness, especially when walking; exhaustion.

Remedies derived from sulfur and phosphor in the homeopathic materia medica

By the same criteria, remedies derived from sulfur and phosphor were selected and symptoms common to all in the respective class were extracted. For the sulfur class, remedies selected were: *Calcarea sulphurica*, *Hepar sulphur*, *Kalium sulphuricum*, *Magnesium sulphuricum*, *Natrum sulphuricum*, *Sulphur* and *Sulphuricum acidum*; for the phosphor class: *Calcarea phosphorica*; *Kalium phosphoricum*; *Magnesium phosphoricum*; *Natrum phosphoricum*; *Phosphoricum acidum* and *Phosphorus*. Results are described in Tables 3 and 4. Symptomatic nuclei of homeopathic remedies derived from sulfur and phosphor were also identified; comparison to the symptomatic nucleus of homeopathic derived from carbon is described in Table 5.

Table 3. Symptoms common to homeopathic remedies derived from sulfur

Total	100
MIND – AILMENTS FROM – mental exertion	BLADDER – URINATION – frequent
MIND – DISCONTENTED	BLADDER – URINATION - frequent – night
MIND – DULLNESS	BLADDER – URINATION – involuntary
MIND – EXCITEMENT	URINE – COPIOUS
MIND – IRRITABILITY	MALE GENITALIA/ SEX – POLLUTIONS
MIND – LAZYNES	FEMALE GENITALIA/SEX – MENSES –
MIND – MENTAL EXERTION – agg	frequent; too
MIND – MENTAL EXERTION – aversion to	FEMALE GENITALIA/SEX – MENSES – painful
MIND – SADNESS	FEMALE GENITALIA/SEX – SEXUAL DESIRE –
MIND – SENSITIVE	increased
MIND WEEPING	LARYNX AND TRACHEA – VOICE – hoarseness
VERTIGO – WALKING – agg	COUGH – DRY
HEAD – CONGESTION	COUGH – TICKLING
HEAD – MENTAL EXERTION – agg	CHEST – CONSTRICTION
HEAD – PAIN	CHEST – PAIN
HEAD – PAIN- mental exertion	BACK – PAIN – lumbar region
HEAD – PAIN – pulsating pain	BACK – PAIN – joints - gouty
HEAD – PAIN – tearing pain	BACK – PAIN – legs – growing pains
HEAD – PAIN – forehead – eyes – above	EXTREMITIES – COLDNESS - feet
HEAD – PULSATING	EXTREMITIES – COLDNESS - hands
HEAD – UNCOVERING – head – agg	EXTREMITIES – CRAMPS – legs - calves
EYE – LACRIMATION	EXTREMITIES – PAIN
EYE – PAIN	EXTREMITIES – PAIN - rheumatic
EYE – PHOTOPHOBIA	EXTREMITIES – PAIN – joints – gouty
EAR – PAIN	EXTREMITIES – PAIN – legs – growing pains
EAR – PAIN – tearing pain	EXTREMITIES – TREMBLING - hands
HEARING – IMPAIRED	EXTREMITIES – WEAKNESS
FACE – DISCOLORATION – pale	SLEEP – RESTLESS
FACE – PAIN	SLEEP – SLEEPINESS
MOUTH – TASTE – bitter	SLEEP – SLEEPLESSNESS
TEETH – PAIN	CHILL – CHILLINESS
TEETH – PAIN - night	SKIN – SENSITIVINESS
THROAT – DRYNESS	GENERALS - NIGHT
THROAT – INFLAMMATION	GENERALS – AIR; DRAFT OF - agg
THROAT – SCRAPING	GENERALS – AIR; IN OPEN - agg
STOMACH – APPETITE – increased	GENERALS – COLD – agg
STOMACH – APPETITE – ravenous	GENERALS – COLD - agg
STOMACH – NAUSEA	GENERALS – COLD – air - agg
STOMACH – PAIN	GENERALS – COLD; BECOMING - agg
ABDOMEN – DISTENSION	GENERALS – DIABETES MELLITUS
ABDOMEN – FLATULENCE	GENERALS - EMACIATION
ABDOMEN - PAIN	GENERALS – EXERTION; physical - agg
ABDOMEN – PAIN - cramping	GENERALS – HEAT – lack of vital heat
ABDOMEN – PAIN – cutting pain	GENERALS - MASTURBATION
RECTUM – CONSTIPATION – difficult stool	GENERALS – MOTION - agg
RECTUM - DIARRHEA	GENERALS – PAIN – Externally – stitching pain
RECTUM – PAIN	GENERALS – PAIN – Externally – tearing pain
RECTUM – PAIN – burning	GENERALS – SENSITIVENESS – pain, to
STOOL – HARD	GENERALS – SENTIVENESS - externally
STOOL – WATERY	GENERALS – TREMBLING - externally

Table 4. Symptoms common to homeopathic remedies derived from phosphor

Total	94
MIND - ANXIETY	RECTUM – DIARRHEA
MIND – CONFUSION of mind	RECTUM – DIARRHEA – morning
MIND – ANGER	RECTUM – PAIN – burning
MIND - EXCITEMENT	STOOL – HARD
MIND - FEAR	STOOL – SOFT
MIND - IRRITABILITY	URETHRA – PAIN – urination – during – agg. – burning
MIND - RESTLESSNESS	FEMALE GENITALIA/ SEX – LEUKORRHEA
MIND - SADNESS	FEMALE GENITALIA/ SEX – LEUKORRHEA – acrid, excoriation
MIND – SADNESS - morning	FEMALE GENITALIA/ SEX – MENSES – copious
MIND – TACITURN	FEMALE GENITALIA/ SEX – MENSES – late, too
MIND – WEEPING	LARYNX AND TRACHEA – VOICE – hoarseness
VERTIGO – VERTIGO	RESPIRATION – DIFFICULT
HEAD – CONSTRICTION	COUGH – MORNING
HEAD – HEAVINESS	COUGH – NIGHT
HEAD – PAIN	COUGH – LOOSE
HEAD – PAIN – pressing pain	EXPECTORATION – MORNING
HEAD – PAIN – stitching pain	EXPECTORATION – MUCOUS
HEAD – PAIN – forehead	CHEST – OPRESSION
EYE – PHOTOPHOBIA	CHEST – PAIN – burning
EAR – NOISES in	CHEST – PAIN – stitching pain
EAR – NOISES in – ringing	BACK – PAIN
EAR – NOISES in – roaring	BACK – AIN – sore
EAR – PAIN	BACK – PAIN – lumbar region
EAR – PAIN – stitching pain	BACK – PAIN – sacral region
NOSE – CORYZA	EXTREMITIES – COLDNESS – feet
NOSE – CORYZA – discharge, with	EXTREMITIES – COLDNESS – hands
NOSE – EPISTAXIS	EXTREMITIES – PAIN – rheumatic
NOSE - SNEEZING	EXTREMITIES – PAIN – elbows
FACE – DISCOLORATION – pale	EXTREMITIES – PAIN – thighs
MOUTH – SALIVATION	EXTREMITIES – PAIN – wrists
MOUTH – TASTE – bitter	SLEEP – RESTLESS
THROAT – DRYNESS	SLEEP – SLEEPINESS
THROAT – MUCUS	SLEEP – SLEEPLESSNESS
THROAT – PAIN – sore	DREAMS – ANXIOUS
THROAT – PAIN – swallowing – agg	DREAMS – FRIGHTFUL
STOMACH – APPETITE – wanting	CHILL – EVENING
STOMACH – ERUCTATIONS; TYPE OF – bitter	CHILL – SHAKING
STOMACH – ERUCTATIONS; TYPE OF – empty	FEVER – NIGHT
STOMACH – HEARTBURN	PERSPIRATION – NIGHT
STOMACH – NAUSEA	SKIN – DISCOLORATION -yellow
STOMACH – PAIN	SKIN – ITCHING
STOMACH – PAIN – cramping	GENERALS – AIR; IN OPEN – amel
ABDOMEN – PAIN	GENERALS – MUCOUS SECRETIONS - yellow
ABDOMEN – PAIN – cramping	GENERALS – TREMBLING – externally
ABDOMEN – RUMBLING	GENERALS – WALKING – air; in open – amel
RECTUM – CONSTIPATION	
RECTUM – CONSTIPATION – difficult stool	

Table 5. Comparison of the symptomatic nuclei of homeopathic remedies derived from carbon, sulfur and phosphor

Carbon	Phosphor	Sulfur
Rage	Unhappiness	Rage
Moroseness		
Anxiety		Anxiety; fear
Distraction; difficult concentration		
Mental confusion; dullness; mental prostration	Dullness	Mental confusion
Forgetfulness; weak memory		
	Excitation	Excitation
Irritability	Irritability	Irritability
Sadness	Sadness	Sadness; in the morning
Indifference	Weeping mood	Weeping mood
Laziness	Laziness	
Sensitiveness to noises	Sensitiveness; external sensitiveness	
Taciturnity		Taciturnity
Shyness		
Vertigo	Vertigo upon walking	Vertigo
Heaviness in the head	Head congestion; pulsations	Heaviness in head; constriction
	Pulsating, tearing headache	Pressing headache; stitching
Headache (forehead)	Headache (forehead); above the eyes	Headache (frontal; occipital)
	Aggravates uncovering the head	
Pain in eyes	Tears; pain in eyes; photophobia	Photophobia
Noises in ears		Noises in ears (bells; roaring)
	Earache; tearing	Earache; stitching
	Decrease audition	
Facial paleness	Facial paleness	
	Pain on the face	
Coryza with cough		Coryza; discharging; watery
		Epistaxis
		Sneezing
Sensitiveness to odors		
	Bitter taste in the mouth	Bitter taste in the mouth
Copious saliva		Salivation
White coating on tongue		
	Toothache; night	
Dryness of mouth	Dryness in the throat	Dryness of the throat
Feeling of a lump in the throat	Inflammation of the throat	Mucus in the throat
Soreness in throat	Feeling of something scratching the throat	Soreness in throat; aggravation by swallowing
Increased appetite	Increased, ravishing appetite	Lack of appetite
		Belching; empty; bitter
		Heartburn
	Nausea	Nausea
	Stomachache; crampy	Stomachache; pressing
Thirst		Thirst
		Mucous vomiting
	Abdominal distension; flatulence	Noises in the abdomen
	Bellyache; crampy; cutting	Bellyache; crampy
Constipation; difficult stools	Constipation; difficult stools	Constipation; difficult stools
		Diarrhea; morning

		Burning pain in rectum
Hard stools	Hard stools; watery	Hard or soft stools
	Frequent micturition, especially in the night; copious urine; involuntary micturition	
Burning pain in urethra, aggravates on urinating		Burning pain in urethra; aggravation by urination
Amorous dreams	Increased sexual desire; pollutions; ailments from masturbation	
		Leucorrhoea: acid, corrosive
	Painful menstruation	Copious menstruation
	Frequent menstruation	Delayed menstruation
	Hoarseness	Hoarseness
		Difficult respiration
General aggravation by coughing		Cough: morning; night
Loose cough	Dry cough; tickling	Dry or loose cough
		Expectoration; morning
Yellow expectoration		Mucous expectoration
Oppression of chest	Constriction of chest	Oppression of chest
Palpitations		
	Pain in chest	Pain in chest; lumbar; sacrum
Backache	Backache: lumbar; stitching	Soreness in the back
	Soreness in the back	Cold hands and feet
	Cold hands and feet	Rheumatic pains
Heaviness in limbs	Rheumatic pain	
	Growth pain in legs	Pain in elbows; wrists; thighs
	Gouty pain in joints	
	Cramps in calves	
Awakening as if by a fright	Restless sleep	Restless sleep
Sleepiness	Sleepiness; sleeplessness	Sleepiness; sleeplessness
Anxious, vivid dreams		Anxious; frightening dreams
Chills in general; internal chill; trembling	Chills with cold feeling	Chills in the evening; trembling
		Night fever
		Night perspiration
		Yellow skin
Burning itch	Sensitiveness of skin	Itch in the skin
Aggravation upon waking up	Aggravation in the night	
Periodicity		
Amelioration in open air; desire of open air	Aggravation by draft of air; in open air	Amelioration in open air; walking in open air
Aggravation by cold; lack of vital heat/// feeling of heat; flushes	Aggravation by cold; by cold air; by becoming cold; lack of vital heat	
Feeling of internal and external heaviness		
		Yellow mucous discharges
Side: right or left		
Pain: soreness; pinching; pressing (internal)	Pain: stitching; tearing. Sensitiveness to pain	
Dryness of normally wet parts of the body		
	External trembling; trembling of hands; muscular jerking	External trembling
Weakness; weakness upon	Weakness; weakness in limbs	Weakness

walking		
Lassitude; weariness		
Aggravation: mental effort; physical effort; motion.	Aggravation: mental effort; physical effort; motion. Aversion to mental effort.	
Amelioration by lying down		
Swelling	Diabetes	
Obesity	Emaciation	

Symptomatic nucleus obtained from the experimental materia medica versus the “carbonic constitution”

As a result of studies by Grauvogl, Nebel, Vannier and Bernard, as mentioned above, it was suggested that homeopathic remedy *Calcarea carbonica* represented the prototype of homeopathic remedies derived from carbon and

furthermore, that it corresponded to a hypothetical “carbonic constitution”. To verify this notion, we compared the symptomatic nucleus of homeopathic remedies derived from carbon with two sources on this so-called carbonic constitution: Bernard [10,11] and Franco [17]. Results are described in Table 6.

Table 6. Comparison of the symptomatic nucleus of homeopathic remedies derived from carbon and the traditional carbonic constitution

According to Bernard	According to Franco	Carbon nucleus
Avoidance of useless efforts	All motions are useful	
Moderate appetite		Increased appetite
Physical resistance to disease	Resistance to fatigue and disease	Lassitude; weakness; weariness
Dedicated to studies	Perseverant in work	Lazy; aversion to mental work
Distraction	Patience and mental resistance	Distracted; difficult concentration
Lack of understanding	Clear and exact; cold and methodic	Mental confusion; dullness
Aversion to sports; aversion to physical effort		
Submissive	Follows orders, but not submissively	Irritable; morose. Quarrelsome
Lack of courage		
Emotional insensitiveness		Irritability; rage; morose; quarrelsome; sadness; indifference; anxiety
Stocks trauma in the memory		Forgetfulness; weak memory
Typical carbonic “stocking” trait		Forgetfulness; weak memory. Copious salivation; coryza; loose cough/// Constipation; swelling
Inferiority complex		
Values order in work	Values precision and order in work	Laziness; aversion to mental work
Firmness	Firm and open in his commentaries	Lassitude
Tranquility		Anxiety
Organization		
	Rigidity	Lassitude
Fine muscles	Increased muscular tonus	Lassitude
	Regularity	
	Repetitive motions	
	Motions lack amplitude	
	Walk is not elegant	

	Beats the heels when walking	
	Quick in work	
		Mental prostration; lassitude; ameliorated by lying down; weakness; aggravates walking; weariness; sleepiness; aggravation by physical effort; upon waking up.
		Taciturn; timid.
		Feeling of weight: head; internal; external; limbs.
		Sensitiveness to noise; to odors.
		Paleness: face; tongue
		Dry mouth; copious salivation; dryness of normally wet internal parts; coryza; dry stools; loose cough.
		Palpitations
		Sleeplessness; wakes up as if frightened
		Ameliorates in open air; desire of open air. Aggravation by cold weather.
		General coldness; internal; worse by cold air; trembling by coldness; lack of vital heat/// burning pain on urinating; burning itch/// feeling of heat; flushes.
Fatness		Obesity

Simple reading of Table 6 shows, beyond all doubts, that there is no correlation whatsoever between the hypothetical “carbonic constitution” as described by Bernard and Franco and the experimental symptomatic nucleus of homeopathic remedies derived from carbon.

Discussion

Regarding the identification of symptomatic nuclei of homeopathic remedies derived from carbon, sulfur and phosphor, it must be reminded that one of our aims was to discuss traditional notions on so-called “homeopathic constitutions”. For this reason these three classes were selected. However, this kind of study can be – and in view of our results, it is desirable – done with any chemical component of homeopathic remedies. In this way, a “calcium nucleus”, a “potassium nucleus”, a “sodium nucleus” have already been identified [13] and in the future further nuclei can be also be found, as e.g. an “acetic nucleus”, a “nitric nucleus” and perhaps also in botanical and other taxonomies. Nevertheless, verification of the symptomatic nuclei identified in this study can only be performed in actual clinical practice, for which further studies are required.

Regarding so-called “homeopathic constitutions”, a flaw can be detected in the very foundation of the full idea. Calcium carbonate is a widely spread substance in nature; it can be found under the most variable forms in all three kingdoms. Homeopathic remedy *Calcarea carbonica* is prepared through trituration of the middle layer of the shell of oysters, which includes traces of phosphate calcium and other substances. There is no *a priori* reason to posit this remedy as a prototype for a class of remedies. To obtain experimental evidence to sustain our objection, we cross-checked the traditional view on so-called “carbonic constitution” against the nucleus of experimental effects of homeopathic remedies derived from carbon and clearly found that there is absolutely no positive correlation.

Our results agree with Zissu’s observations, warning against the confusion between biotypology and homeopathy, reminding that whereas homeopathy is a medical specialty that approaches the manifestations of disease through the principle of therapeutic similarity, biotypology studies human types in order to make classifications

grounded on morphological data and without taking disease into account [12].

Symptomatic nuclei do not constitute easy shortcuts for actual prescription but a methodological tool in the process of homeopathic medical decision-making. Recognizance of one of such nuclei in an actual patient may facilitate both positive and differential diagnosis, through the characteristic signs and symptoms of each individual patient. Moreover, combination of such nuclei, possible in the case of mineral compounds [18], allows one to widen the scope of possible indications to include less known members of a same chemical group, once again, on the grounds of the individual patient's characteristic signs and symptoms.

Conclusion

Comparison of symptoms common to homeopathic remedies derived from carbon allowed us to elaborate a symptomatic nucleus of the class that may prove helpful in daily clinical practice. On the other hand, to posit homeopathic remedy *Calcarea carbonica* as the prototype of this class has no empirical grounds.

The symptomatic nucleus of homeopathic remedies derived from carbon is qualitatively different from both the symptomatic nuclei of homeopathic remedies derived from phosphor and sulfur, and so-called "carbonic constitution". The latter does not seem to have support in experimental homeopathic knowledge.

References

1. Hahnemann CFS. Doenças crônicas: sua natureza peculiar e sua cura homeopática. 2nd ed. São Paulo (Brazil): Grupo de Estudos Homeopáticos de São Paulo "Benoît Mure"; 1984.
2. Ghatak N. Enfermedades crónicas: su causa y curación. Buenos Aires (Argentina): Albatros; 1991.
3. Masi Elizalde A. Actas del Instituto de Altos Estudios Homeopáticos "James Tyler Kent", vol 8. Buenos Aires; 1994.
4. Sankaran R. About homeopathy [homepage]. Mumbai: Sankaran's Clinic. [cited 2008 May 15]

Available from: <http://www.sankaransclinic.com/abthmpty.htm>.

5. Scholten J. Homeopathy and classifications [homepage]. Utrecht: Jan Scholten. [cited 2008 May 15] Available from: <http://www.janscholten.com/files/homeopathy%20classification.pdf>.
6. Leeser O. Textbook of Materia Medica. New Delhi (India): B Jain; 2000.
7. Von Grauvogl E. Text book of homeopathy. New York (United States): Boericke & Tafel; 1870.
8. Schlüssler WH. Una terapia abreviada: guía para el tratamiento bioquímico de las enfermedades. Rio de Janeiro (Brazil): Federação Brasileira de Homeopatia; 1981.
9. Conan Mériadec M. Histórico das diáteses mórbidas às diáteses reacionais. In: Cornillot P, editor. Tratado de Homeopatia. Porto Alegre (Brazil): Artmed; 2005. 96-120.
10. Bernard H. Doctrine homéopathique. Paris (France): Coquemard; 1966.
11. Bernard H. Traité de médecine homéopathique. Paris (France): Coquemard; 1974.
12. Zissu R. Homeopatia e biotipologias. In: Cornillot P, editor. Tratado de Homeopatia. Porto Alegre (Brazil): Artmed; 2005. 121-129.
13. Bungetzianu G, Jurj G. Matéria médica clínica. São Paulo (Brazil): Organon; 2008.
14. Jurj G. A repertory analysis of the high degree symptoms of the main Solanaceae. Rev Rom de Homeopatie. 1999; 4: 45-49.
15. Jurj G. O analiza repertoriala completa a clasei loganiaceelor. Rev Rom de Homeopatie. 2000; 4(12): 16-22.
16. Schroyens F. Synthesis 9. Namur (Belgium): Archibel; 2006.
17. Franco FJB. Constituição e temperamento: visão unicista e aplicação prática. São Paulo (Brazil): Organon; 2004.
18. Kent JT. New remedies, clinical cases, lesser writings, aphorisms and precepts. Chicago (United States): Erhart and Karl; 1926.



Licensed to [GIRI](#)

Support: authors declare that this study received no funding

Conflict of interest: authors declare there is no conflict of interest

Received: 05 Feb 2009; Revised 12 Mar 2009; Published: 31 Mar 2009

Correspondence author: Luciana Costa Lima Thomaz, luc_thomaz@hotmail.com

How to cite this article: Thomaz LCL. Symptomatic nuclei of homeopathic remedies: remedies derived from carbon as case-study. Int J High Dilution Res. [online]. 2009 [cited YYYY Month dd]; 8 (26): 15-25. Available from: <http://www.feg.unesp.br/~ojs/index.php/ijhdr/article/view/330/381>.