



<http://dx.doi.org/10.11646/zootaxa.3869.3.8>

<http://zoobank.org/urn:lsid:zoobank.org:pub:0A5CF0E7-A48C-41EB-B638-6E7D9A6C0D98>

### Correcting the “correct” name for the Asian Brown Flycatcher (Aves: Passeriformes, Muscicapidae, *Muscicapa*)

EDWARD C. DICKINSON<sup>1</sup>, RICHARD SCHODDE<sup>2</sup>, SVEN KULLANDER<sup>3</sup>, PIERRE ANDRÉ CROCHET<sup>4</sup>,  
ANDY ELLIOTT<sup>5</sup> & GUY M. KIRWAN<sup>6</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Flat 3, Bolsover Court, 19 Bolsover Road, Eastbourne, BN20 7JG, U.K. E-mail: [edward@asiaorn.org](mailto:edward@asiaorn.org)

<sup>2</sup>Australian Biological Resources Study, G.P.O. Box 787, Canberra City, ACT, Australia 2601. E-mail: [rschodde@grapevine.com.au](mailto:rschodde@grapevine.com.au)

<sup>3</sup>Department of Zoology, Swedish Museum of Natural History, P. O. Box 50007, SE-104 05 Stockholm, Sweden.

E-mail: [sven.kullander@nrm.se](mailto:sven.kullander@nrm.se)

<sup>4</sup>CNRS-UMR5175 CEFÉ, Centre d'Ecologie Fonctionnelle et Evolutive, 1919, route de Mende, 34293 Montpellier cedex 5, France.

E-mail: [pierre-andre.crochet@cefe.cnrs.fr](mailto:pierre-andre.crochet@cefe.cnrs.fr)

<sup>5</sup>c/o Lynx Edicions, Montseny 8, E-08193 Bellaterra, Catalunya, Spain. E-mail: [andyep@hbw.com](mailto:andyep@hbw.com)

<sup>6</sup>Research Associate, Field Museum of Natural History, 1400 Lake Shore Drive, Chicago, Illinois IL 60605, USA.

E-mail: [gmkirwan@aol.com](mailto:gmkirwan@aol.com)

Mlíkovský (2012) claimed that *Muscicapa latirostris* Raffles, 1822 was the correct name for the Asian Brown Flycatcher, and rejected its senior synonym, *Muscicapa dauurica* Pallas, 1811. *Muscicapa dauurica* is in equal or greater use today for this flycatcher, to which the references to it in Mlíkovský (2012) testify even though they are far from comprehensive. Other major references using *dauurica* Pallas are Sibley & Monroe (1990), Inskipp *et al.* (1996), Kennedy *et al.* (2000), Dickinson (2003), Rasmussen & Anderton (2005), Clement (2006), Wells (2007) and Mann (2008).

The heart of Mlíkovský's (2012) argument lies in his reference to Pallas's (1811a: 461) original description of *dauurica* as a variety of *Muscicapa grisola* (“*Muscicapa Grisola*  $\beta$  *Varietas Daurica*”). Mlíkovský dismissed this as “nothing more than ‘a Daurian variety’ (of *Muscicapa grisola*) in his [Pallas's] Latin-language book. Pallas (1811a,b) used to list varieties in this way, which, unfortunately, misled various subsequent authors to understand these technical terms as scientific names...”.

In his posthumously published descriptive catalogue of Russian animals, Pallas (1811a,b) makes numerous references to “varieties”. They include colour variations and domestic breeds as well as morphological and/or geographical entities. In several cases, it is clear that he refers to those varieties with descriptive terms. Unfortunately, Pallas writes consistently in Latin, without making clear distinction between scientific names and other words. Later authors have understood most of his varieties as infrasubspecific individual variation, and have neglected the varieties denoted solely by a Greek letter, adopting instead a subset of varieties as available names because they refer to diagnosed geographic entities. These include the bird names “*Muscicapa Grisola*  $\beta$  *Varietas Daurica*”, which is followed by a detailed diagnosis distinguishing it from other *Muscicapa grisola*; and *Tetrao Perdix* “*Varietatis rupestris dauuricae*” (currently *Perdix dauurica*), followed by a diagnosis. Both are geographical names, referring to the distribution in Dauria (Transbaikal). Regardless of how other varieties are treated in Pallas (1811a,b), the descriptions of those two varieties are perfectly acceptable as descriptions of subspecific taxa (see example 1 under Article 45.6.4 of the *International Code of Zoological Nomenclature* 1999).

The taxonomic category “variety” is today considered infrasubspecific by the *International Code of Zoological Nomenclature* (International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature 1999; hereafter the Code); and newly-named varieties are now unavailable and fall outside regulation (Articles 1.3.4, 10.2, 15.2, 23.3.4, 45.5 and Glossary of the Code). Mlíkovský (2012) cited none of these rulings or definitions, but did mention following the Code on nomenclatural matters. What he has evidently overlooked, however, are the provisions of Article 45.6 which permit the specific or subspecific acceptance, under certain conditions, of nominal categories that would be considered infrasubspecific today. Moreover, Articles 1.3.4, 10.2 and 45.5 make it clear by reference that Article 45.6 takes precedence if those conditions are met. In the case of *Muscicapa grisola* var. *dauurica* Pallas, clause 4 of Article 45.6 is critical. It states: “it (= the name) is subspecific if first published before 1961 and its author expressly used one of the terms “variety” or “form” (including use of the terms “var.”, “forma”, “v.” and “f.”, unless its author expressly gave it infrasubspecific rank, or the

content of the work unambiguously reveals that the name was proposed for an infrasubspecific entity". Pallas (1811a,b) did not expressly treat all his varieties as infrasubspecific. As explained above, some, including his var. *daurica*, were described as regional forms equivalent to the subspecific category used in zoology today. We interpret *daurica* Pallas as such here, and conclude that Article 45.6.4 rules that it should be so treated. Table I below sets out over 50 similar in-use avian names, from more than 30 authors during the period 1811 to 1911, that have been accepted as geographical forms, above infrasubspecific category and so within the scope of the Code (Article 1.2.2). The list does not include names now in synonymy, nor those that are not evidently geographical, or which would be hard to find through shifts in specific epithets.

Because of Pallas's (1811a,b) other usages of the category "variety", nevertheless, Mlíkovský (2012) clearly considered that "var. *daurica*" was proposed for an infrasubspecific entity, and so outside regulation by the Code and unavailable (Article 1.3.4). While it is our opinion that the name was employed in a subspecific sense, we can understand that others might still take Mlíkovský's view. In those circumstances, Art. 45.6.4.1 applies. It rules that genuinely infrasubspecific names are deemed to be subspecific from their original publication if they have been adopted as the valid name of a species or subspecies before 1985. This in fact has been done, by Dement'ev (1935), as Mlíkovský himself points out, and in both the Russian and English editions of Dement'ev & Gladkov (1968 = 1954). Mlíkovský attributed authorship of *daurica* (an incorrect subsequent spelling) to Dement'ev (1935) under Art. 13.1.2 of the Code, but Dement'ev (*l.c.*) expressly referred the name to Pallas, so Mlíkovský's action is precluded explicitly by Art. 45.6.4.1 which directs that the original publication of *daurica* by Pallas in 1811 must be adopted.

Pallas's name *daurica* is thus to be treated as subspecific, either under Article 45.6.4 of the Code or its subclause 45.6.4.1, according to interpretation of its original status. This justifies the finding of Watson in the monumental *Checklist of Birds of the World* (Watson *et al.* 1986: 318, footnote). Watson's view, misrepresented by Mlíkovský (2012), is also supported by Article 45 (f)(ii) and 45 (g) of edition 3 of the Code (International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature 1985) which was then operative. Pallas's publication of *daurica* in 1811 also fulfils all of the Code's criteria of availability (Articles 11.1–11.5, 11.9 and 12). Being demonstrably widely in use (Mlíkovský 2012 and above) and senior to *latirostris* Raffles, 1822, *daurica* automatically takes precedence and is the correct name for the Asian Brown Flycatcher.

**TABLE I.** Evidence supporting the availability of avian names that have included the term Var. or equivalent. For citations to the source of each of the names below see Peters (1931–1987). Dates as in Peters (uncorrected).

Date	Original combination (basionym)	Author	Peters
1811	<i>Muscicapa Grisola</i> var. <i>Daurica</i>	Pallas	XI: 318
1811	<i>Tetrao perdix</i> var. <i>daurica</i>	Pallas	II: 89
1833	<i>Curruca galactodes</i> var. <i>syriaca</i>	Hemprich & Ehrenberg	X: 22
1833	<i>Lanii senegalii</i> var. <i>minor habessinica</i>	Hemprich & Ehrenberg	IX: 322
1833	<i>Turdus Merula</i> var. <i>syriaca</i>	Hemprich & Ehrenberg	X: 190
1834	<i>Ardea purpurea</i> var. <i>manilensis</i>	Meyen	I: (1 <sup>st</sup> edn.): 101
1840	<i>Buceros rhinoceros</i> var. <i>Borneoensis</i>	Schlegel & Müller	V: 270
1858	<i>Eclectus polychlorus</i> var. <i>aruensis</i>	G.R. Gray	III: 232
1860	<i>Ardea (Butorides) virescens</i> var. <i>amurensis</i>	Schrenck	I (1 <sup>st</sup> edn.): 223
1863	<i>Dendrocitta sinensis</i> , var. <i>formosae</i>	Swinhoe	XV: 249
1863	<i>Falco vespertinus</i> var. <i>amurensis</i>	Radde	I (1 <sup>st</sup> edn.): 298
1865	<i>Carpophaga aenea</i> var. <i>nicobarica</i>	Pelzeln	III: 46
1865	<i>Macropygia amboinensis</i> var. <i>macassariensis</i>	Wallace	III: 78
1865	<i>Chætura gigantea</i> var. <i>celebensis</i>	P.L. Sclater	IV: 233
1866	<i>Icterus dominicensis</i> var. <i>portoricensis</i>	H. Bryant	XIV: 163
1867	<i>Tyrannula cariboea</i> (sic) (var. <i>hispaniolensis</i> )	H. Bryant	VIII: 135
1867	<i>Psittacus collarius</i> (var. <i>bahamensis</i> )	H. Bryant	III: 217
1867	<i>Tyrannula stolidus</i> (var. <i>lucaysiensis</i> )	H. Bryant	VIII: 205

.....continued on the next page

TABLE 1. (Continued)

Date	Original combination (basonym)	Author	Peters
1867	<i>Tyrannula stolidus</i> (var. <i>dominicensis</i> )	H. Bryant	VIII: 205
1868	<i>Pernis cristatus</i> var. <i>celebensis</i>	Wallace	I (2 <sup>nd</sup> edn.): 288
1872	<i>Anas superciliosa</i> var. <i>pelewensis</i>	Hartlaub & Finsch	I (1 <sup>st</sup> edn.): 160
1872	<i>Ortyx virginianus</i> var. <i>floridanus</i>	Coues	II: 47
1872	<i>Porphyrio melanotus</i> Temm. var. <i>pelewensis</i>	Hartlaub & Finsch	II: 208
1873	<i>Scops asio</i> var. <i>Floridanus</i>	Ridgway	IV: 101
1874	<i>Cyanocitta ultramarina</i> var. <i>arizonae</i>	[Baird &] Ridgway	XV: 214
1874	<i>Speotyto cunicularia</i> var. <i>floridana</i>	Ridgway	IV: 151
1874	<i>Buteo borealis</i> var. <i>costaricensis</i>	Ridgway	I (1 <sup>st</sup> edn.): 232
1874	<i>Pionias Pucherani</i> var. <i>jobiensis</i>	A.B. Meyer	III: 235
1874	<i>Melospiza melodia</i> var. <i>mexicana</i>	Ridgway	XIII: 52
1874	<i>Pachycephala griseiceps</i> var. <i>jobiensis</i>	A.B. Meyer	XII: 17
1873	<i>Strix flammea</i> var. <i>Guatemalæ</i>	Ridgway	IV: 80
1875	<i>Caloenas nicobarica</i> var. <i>pelewensis</i>	Finsch	III: 139
1875	<i>Thryothorus Ludovicianus</i> var. <i>Miamensis</i>	Ridgway	IX: 409
1876	<i>M[otacilla] personata</i> Gould var. <i>Persica</i>	Blanford	IX: 138
1878	<i>Chalcophaps chrysochlora</i> , <i>Sandwichensis</i> Var.	E.P. Ramsay	III: 115
1879	<i>Rallus gularis</i> var. <i>aldabrana</i>	Günther	II: 170
1879	<i>Paradisaea apoda</i> var. <i>novaeguineae</i>	D'Albertis & Salvadori	
1880	<i>Rallus longirostris</i> var. <i>caribæus</i>	Ridgway	II: 158
1881	<i>Semioptera wallacii</i> var. <i>Halmaherae</i>	Salvadori	XV: 188
1883	<i>Regulus cristatus</i> var. <i>azoricus</i>	Seebohm	XI: 288
1884	<i>Cyanistes cyanus</i> var. <i>tian-schanicus</i>	Menzbier	XII: 116
1885	<i>Merops philippinus</i> var. <i>celebensis</i>	W.H. Blasius	
1888	<i>Columba arquatrix</i> var. <i>thomensis</i>	Bocage	III: 65
1888	<i>Carpophaga aenea</i> (Linn.) nov. var. <i>palawanensis</i>	W.H. Blasius	III: 47
1889	<i>Z[osterops] simplex</i> var. <i>loochooensis</i>	Tristram	XII: 292
1890	<i>Dicrurus leucogenys</i> var. <i>salangensis</i>	Reichenow	XV: 144
1890	<i>Thriponax javensis</i> var. nov. <i>suluënsis</i>	W.H. Blasius	VI: 154
1902	<i>Irrisor erythrorhynchus</i> var. <i>angolensis</i>	Reichenow	V: 251
1903	<i>Pomatorhynchus tschagra</i> var. <i>natalensis</i>	Reichenow	IX: 323
1904	<i>Poliospiza tristriata</i> var. <i>benguellensis</i>	Reichenow	XIV: 225
1905	<i>Oedinemus capensis</i> var. <i>damarensis</i>	Reichenow	II: 296
1911	[ <i>Uraeginthus bengalus</i> ] var. <i>niassensis</i>	Reichenow	XIV: 332
1911	[ <i>Uraeginthus bengalus</i> ] var. <i>ugogensis</i> (sic)	Reichenow	XIV: 334
1911	<i>Tetrao tetrax</i> var. <i>baikalensis</i>	Lorenz	II: 27
1911	<i>Tetrao tetrax</i> var. <i>ussuriensis</i>	Kohts	II: 28

The above arguments for authorship of the Asian Brown Flycatcher have been reviewed by the Research Coordinating Committee (RCCAN), formerly Standing Committee on Ornithological Nomenclature (SCON), of the International Ornithologists' Union. Of respondents, all (including 100% of the Committee) supported *Muscicapa grisola* var. *daurica* Pallas, 1811 as validly available, and, therefore, that *Muscicapa daurica* Pallas, 1811 is the valid senior name for this species.

We thank Theo de Kok his prompt assistance in locating most of the names listed in Table I and Robert J. Dowsett for adding others.

## References

- Clement, P. (2006) *Muscicapa dauurica*. In: del Hoyo, J., Elliott, A. & Christie, D.A. (Eds.), *Handbook of the Birds of the World*. Vol. 11. *Old World Flycatchers to Old World Warblers*. Lynx Edicions, Barcelona, pp. 116.
- Dement'ev, G.P. (1935) *Systema Avium Rossicarum*. III. Passeriformes (suite). *L'Oiseau et la Revue Française d'Ornithologie*, 5, 70–106.
- Dement'ev, G.P. & Gladkov, N.A. (1968) *Birds of the Soviet Union*. 6. Israel Program for Scientific Translation, Jerusalem, xx + 879 pp.
- Dickinson, E.C. (Ed.) (2003) *The Howard & Moore Complete Checklist of the Birds of the World*. 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition. Christopher Helm, London, 1039 pp.
- Inskipp, T.P., Lindsey, N. & Duckworth, J.W. (1996) *An Annotated Checklist of the Birds of the Oriental Region*. The Oriental Bird Club, Sandy, Beds., U.K., x + 294 pp.
- International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature (1985) *International Code of Zoological Nomenclature*. 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition. The International Trust for Zoological Nomenclature, London, xx + 338 pp.  
<http://dx.doi.org/10.5962/bhl.title.50608>
- International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature (1999) *International Code of Zoological Nomenclature*. 4<sup>th</sup> Edition. The International Trust for Zoological Nomenclature, London, xxix + 306 pp.  
<http://dx.doi.org/10.5962/bhl.title.50608>
- Kennedy, R.S., Gonzales, P.C., Dickinson, E.C., Miranda, Jr., H.C. & Fisher, T.H. (2000) *A Guide to the Birds of the Philippines*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, xx + 369 pp.
- Mann, C.F. (2008) *The Birds of Borneo. An Annotated Checklist*. BOU Check-list Series No. 23. British Ornithologists' Union and British Ornithologists' Club, Peterborough, U.K., xvi + 440 pp.
- Mlíkovský, J. (2012) Correct name for the Asian Brown Flycatcher (Aves: Muscicapidae, *Muscicapa*). *Zootaxa*, 3393, 53–56.
- Pallas, P. (1811a) *Zoographia Rosso-Asiatica*. 1. Officina Caes. Acad. Scientiarum, Petropoli [= St. Petersburg], xviii + 568 pp.
- Pallas, P. (1811b) *Zoographia Rosso-Asiatica*. 2. Officina Caes. Acad. Scientiarum, Petropoli [= St. Petersburg], vii + 374 pp.
- Peters, J.L. (1931) *Check-list of birds of the world*. Vol. 1. 1<sup>st</sup> Edition. Harvard University Press, Cambridge, Massachusetts, xviii + 1345 pp.
- Peters, J.L. (1934) *Check-list of birds of the world*. Vol. 2. Harvard University Press, Cambridge, Massachusetts, xvii + 401 pp.
- Peters, J.L. (1937) *Check-list of birds of the world*. Vol. 3. Harvard University Press, Cambridge, Massachusetts, xiii + 311 pp.
- Peters, J.L. (1940) *Check-list of birds of the world*. Vol. 4. Harvard University Press, Cambridge, Massachusetts, xii + 291 pp.
- Peters, J.L. (1945) *Check-list of birds of the world*. Vol. 5. Harvard University Press, Cambridge, Massachusetts, xi + 306 pp.
- Peters, J.L. (1948) *Check-list of birds of the world*. Vol. 6. Harvard University Press, Cambridge, Massachusetts, xi + 259 pp.
- Peters, J.L. (1951) *Check-list of birds of the world*. Vol. 7. Museum of Comparative Zoology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, x + 318 pp.
- Traylor, M.A. Jr. (Ed.) (1979) *Check-list of birds of the world\**. Vol. 8. Museum of Comparative Zoology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, xv + 365 pp. [Note: all titles marked with an asterisk are 'short titles'; on the title page proper each such short title was followed by "A Continuation of the Work of James L. Peters"]
- Mayr, E. & Greenway, J.C. Jr. (Eds.) (1960) *Check-list of birds of the world\**. Vol. 9. Museum of Comparative Zoology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, xii + 506 pp.
- Mayr, E. & Paynter, R.A. Jr. (Eds.), (1964) *Check-list of birds of the world\**. Vol. 10. Museum of Comparative Zoology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, xv + 365 pp.
- Mayr, E. & Cottrell, G.W. (Eds.) (1986) *Check-list of birds of the world\**. Vol. 11. Museum of Comparative Zoology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, xii + 638 pp.
- Paynter, R.A. Jr. (Ed.) (1967) *Check-list of birds of the world\**. Vol. 12. Museum of Comparative Zoology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, xii + 495 pp.
- Paynter, R.A. Jr. (Ed.) (1970) *Check-list of birds of the world\**. Vol. 13. Museum of Comparative Zoology, Cambridge,

- Massachusetts, xvi + 443 pp.
- Paynter, R.A. Jr. (Ed.) (1968) *Check-list of birds of the world\**. Vol. 14. Museum of Comparative Zoology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, xii + 443 pp.
- Mayr, E. & Greenway, J.C. Jr. (Eds) (1962) *Check-list of birds of the world\**. Vol. 15. Museum of Comparative Zoology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, xii + 315 pp.
- Paynter, R.A. Jr. (Ed.) (1987) *Check-list of birds of the world. Vol. 15. (Index)*. Museum of Comparative Zoology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, xii + 550 pp.
- Mayr, E. & Cottrell, G.W. (Eds.) (1986) *Check-list of birds of the world. Revision of the Work of James L. Peters. Vol. 1. 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition*. Museum of Comparative Zoology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, xviii + 547 pp.
- Raffles, T.S. (1822) Second part of the descriptive catalogue of a zoological collection made in the island of Sumatra and its vicinity. *Transactions of the Linnean Society of London*, 13 (2), 277–340.  
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1095-8339.1821.tb00065.x>
- Rasmussen, P.C. & Anderton, J.C. (2005) *Birds of South Asia. The Ripley Guide. Vol. 2*. Smithsonian Institution and Lynx Edicions, Washington D.C. and Barcelona, 683 pp.
- Sibley, C.G. & Monroe, B.L. Jr. (1990) *Distribution and Taxonomy of Birds of the World*. Yale University Press, New Haven, Connecticut, xxiv + 1111 pp.
- Watson, G.E. (1986) [Footnote.] In: Watson, G.E., Traylor, M.A. Jr. & Mayr, E. (Eds.), *Passeriformes: Suborder Oscines, Family Muscicapidae (Sensu Stricto)*. In: Mayr, E. & Cottrell, G.W. (Eds), *Check-list of Birds of the World. A Continuation of the Work of James L. Peters, 11*. Museum of Comparative Zoology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, pp. 295–375.
- Wells, D.R. (2007) *The Birds of the Thai-Malay Peninsula. Vol. 2*. Christopher Helm, London, 800 pp.