

Enacting public journalism at the Navajo
Times:
Speaking from the community

Enacting public journalism at the Navajo
Times:
Speaking from the community

Marcella LaFever, Ph.D.
Communication Studies
California State University Stanislaus
1 University Circle
Turlock, CA 95382
MLaFever@csustan.edu

Keena Neal, M.A.
Veterans Administration
Albuquerque, N.M.
Neal.keena@gmail.com

Abstract:

The use of stereotypes as a matter of convenience, and interviewing only those whose hold positions of power in the community; these are typical routines for newspaper reporting. The present research project examined the contention that ethnic newspapers offer an alternative forum for the voice of marginalized groups. A discussion of traditional media structures, problems that these structures create for marginalized groups, and the use of alternative styles of journalism are looked at through a comparison of the Navajo Times, a newspaper of the Navajo Nation, and the Gallup Independent, a privately-owned newspaper serving the same geographic area. We found that the Navajo Times enacted public journalism principles by using more quotes from non-elite sources (persons who are not labeled by positions of power), and placed more of these non-elite sources on the front page. The present study can assist instructors of Native American journalism students, as well as publishers, editors, and journalists of Native American and other ethnic newspaper publications in attending to who is quoted as sources for stories.

Enacting public journalism at the Navajo
Times:

Speaking from the community

Communities depend on, and are influenced by the media through portrayals of issues and people in the community. Public deliberation of issues is generally accepted as the backbone of democracy and the democratic process, but serious questions have arisen about the role of the media in that process of deliberation (Haas & Steiner, 2001; Pan & Kosicki, 2001; Tuchman, 1978). Habermas (1989) posited that power leads to distorted communication and that a public sphere dominated by media does not allow for marginalized (non-elite) voices. Due to media routines that include such things as the use of stereotyping out of convenience, and utilization of elite information sources, the flow of information and opinions is skewed (Kenix, 2005; Perkins & Starosta, 2001; Schudson, 2001; Weston, 1996).

Public journalism scholars contend that public journalism addresses the flaws found in traditional journalism (Haas & Steiner, 2001; Lambeth, 1998; McGregor, Fountaine & Comrie, 2000; Merritt, 1996) and that ethnic newspapers have proven an important space for public journalism (Corrigan, 1999; Kaniss, 1991; Kessler, 1984). The present research project investigates the use of elite versus non-elite voices and asks whether an ethnic newspaper, The Navajo Times, uses more non-elite sources to relay community news. This chapter will discuss power and the media; access to the media; the Navajo Times as alternative press; and, the issue of elite source indexing, as background to positing of the following two hypotheses:

H1: Ethnic publications will provide more source quotes from non-elite

sources than traditional newspaper publications.

H2: Ethnic publications will position more non-elite sources on the front page of newspaper articles than will traditional newspaper publications.

Power and the media

Mass media as societal institutions are an important element in how citizens make sense of the world around them. According to critical theorists (Gramsci, 1971; Hall, 1989), the ideal state is a social environment in which all voices can be heard and where no voice dominates any other. However, mass media often produce and reproduce everyday activities of communication which reinforce dominant ideologies. Ideologies are sets of ideas that structure reality and represent codes of meaning that govern how we see the world (Littlejohn, 1999). Ideologies are imbedded within social practices, structures and institutions such as newspapers. These imbedded ideologies produce a hegemony of ideas in which one group in society exerts leadership and domination over others (Gramsci, 1971; Hall, 1989). Newspapers are one form of mass media that traditionally do not allow for the voice of marginalized groups (Ericson, Baranek & Chan, 1989; Ewart, 2003; Kaniss, 1991; Kessler, 1984; Tuchman, 1978).

Newspapers are an important form of mass media communication. Research shows that 90 percent of those who are aware of a given news event first learn about it through the mass media (Mayer, Gudykunst, Perrill & Merrill, 1990). Radio and television predominate as the first sources of such information, with newspapers usually being the first source for less important news events. When there is a major crisis, people utilize television (Rogers & Seidel, 2002) but if they want more in-depth information or

want to keep up on the ongoing news, they will turn to newspapers (Chaffee & Kanihan, 1997). Reliance on a newspaper for news also predicts information recall. Immigrant citizens have a strong newspaper exposure-to-knowledge correlation (Chaffee & Kanihan, 1997). It is therefore important to look at the ways in which newspapers produce hegemony of ideas in society.

A traditionally accepted principle that news reporters live by is that of being 'objective.' While traditional journalism purports to be concerned overwhelmingly with objectivity, in fact it can be seen to be ethnocentric (Prince, 2004; Schudson, 2001; Zubric & Holbert, 2000). Objectivity is defined as adopting a position of detachment and neutrality; not taking sides or showing bias; reporting the truth; and lack of a motive to serve a third party (McQuail, 1994). However, journalists tend to cover those communities with which they hold some affiliation (McDevitt, 2003; Rosen, 1999; Schudson, 2001).

Statistics show that of journalism and mass communication graduates between 1987 and 1997, 15 percent were minorities (Gender, 2000). Journalists of color (in newsrooms) increased by only 1.2 percent from 1994 to 1997. In addition, nearly seven percent of minority journalists left the industry each year from 1994 to 1999, compared with four percent of white newspaper journalists (McGill, 2000). Additionally, while some newspapers (such as the Gallup Independent) may claim a high percentage of employees that reflect the cultural community make-up, these are not necessarily in the reporter ranks (Prince, 2004). If journalists tend to cover the communities with which they hold affiliation, who is in the newsroom is important.

News narratives help citizens make sense of the world and as a matter of convenience many journalistic narratives employ stereotypes. Stereotypes are generalizations about a group that oversimplify reality. Stereotypes help us know what to expect from others but can be detrimental when they are negative, inaccurate and/or when they are held rigidly. While the use of stereotypes by reporters is a matter of convenience in delivering a story, stereotypes perpetuate inaccurate views of marginalized groups (LaFever, 2005). Stereotypes in newspaper journalism can be conveyed through the selection of sources, through how these sources are quoted, and through their placement in the body of the text (Ewart, 2003; Miller & Ross, 2004; Perkins & Starosta, 2001; Weston, 1996). These journalistic practices create problems for the voices of marginalized groups to be heard in the public sphere.

Access to the media

The concept of public journalism has been proposed as an alternative to traditional journalism in the effort to privilege marginalized voices (Adebanwi, 2004; Campbell, 2004; Lambeth, 1998; Merritt, 1996). Public journalism is defined as an engagement of reporters and media with the community they are reporting on. Stated goals for public journalism (Corrigan, 1999; Evelio, 2002; Voakes, 2004) include affiliation with the community being reported on, interaction with individuals and institutions in the community, utilizing alternative way of framing stories, and the utilization of non-elite sources. Unfortunately, current research on public journalism shows that it continues to miss the mark in providing a voice to marginalized groups (Blom, 2004; Ewart, 2003; Kenix, 2005; Massey, 1998; Miller & Ross, 2004).

Haas and Steiner (2001) contended that public journalism does not take into consideration how social inequality affects the ability of groups to share in the public conversation. Limited access to the mainstream media is one way in which social inequality restricts this conversation. Some social movements and interest groups, along with non-mainstream politicians and activists, have more ability to have their views published than do others (Kessler, 1984; Tuchman, 1978; Wasserman & de Beer, 2005). Those who have been legitimized by position, title, or connection to government are more likely to have their opinions or stories aired than marginalized, low-socioeconomic groups and individuals. Easy access to the media usually requires ongoing relationships with reporters, relationships that have not been developed either by the reporters or by the groups. These marginalized groups have traditionally used three major strategies to try to gain access to the media: cultivation of middle-class supporters with media contacts (Tuchman, 1978), the staging of disruptive events (Corrigan, 1999; Kessler, 1984; Tuchman, 1978), or the establishment of an alternative press (Corrigan, 1999; Kaniss, 1991; Kessler, 1984).

All of the above options come with their own problems. Cultivation of supporters with media contacts depends upon the interests of someone else and there is often a great deal of distrust of the media involved (Tuchman, 1978). The staging of disruptive events tends to focus the media on the event rather than the issue (Kessler, 1984) and/or the use of conflict tactics delegitimizes the group even further. Finally, there is the creation of dissident/ alternative/ specialized press. Specialized press is an area that deserves more exploration in the present

paper, given that the Navajo Times can be seen as such a publication.

Alternative press and the Navajo Times

The need to communicate as yet unacceptable ideas, and the general lack of access to traditional press, led to the development of press alternatives (Kessler, 1984). These dissident voices included ethnic, political and religious groups, women and men, both urban and rural. Publishing a paper was seen as a way to improve social conditions. Major press groups were the Black press, the Jewish press, immigrant and foreign-language press, and feminist and gay press (Kaniss, 1991; Tuchman, 1978).

In the 1950s and 1960s, many areas (mostly urban) began to see more politically radical media known as the 'underground press' (Kaniss, 1991). These papers were involved in events that were taking place and did not pretend to be unbiased reporting. They acted as bulletin boards for activities such as protest rallies and as places where the dominant ideology was opposed.

The 1960s also personified the start of a trend towards local specialized press or community press (Kaniss, 1991). These papers were meant to report local news that would not make it into the large dailies, to promote local welfare and projects, and to provide recognition to local heroes, among other functions. They also developed for small towns or what is called the one newspaper town. Corrigan (1999) argued that these newspapers are the stimulation for the public journalism movement. The Navajo Times and the Gallup Independent can both be seen as fitting into this category. In addition, the Navajo Times is an ethnic press publication due to the nature of its ownership being the Navajo Nation and not a private enterprise.

The newspaper, as a means of communicating among aboriginal peoples in North America, has been around for a long time (Trahan, 2000). The first edition of the Cherokee Phoenix was published on February 21, 1828. This bilingual newspaper (Cherokee and English) was published by the Cherokee Nation; using the alphabet developed by Sequoyah (Littlefield & Parins, 1984; Murphy & Murphy, 1981). The Navajo Times was established in 1959 and is the largest Native American owned newspaper (Covering, 2007), with a current paid circulation of 21,909 (Navajo, 2008) and is owned by the Navajo Nation, the largest tribe in the United States (Trahan, 2000). The Navajo Times, as alternative press, is alive and well and offers an excellent site for research into whether there is an increased use of non-elite community voices in portraying community issues and news.

Elite source indexing. One area where public journalism has missed the mark is in the use of non-elite over elite sources (Campbell, 2004; Ewart, 2003; 1999; Massey, 1998). Direct quotation in print news stories can be effective in swaying readers' opinions to one side of an issue. Elite sources are those such as official spokespersons and other heavily-quoted individuals. Elite sources are those that have a political or economic stake in what is being reported. Non-elite sources are individuals not involved in the governmental process, or who have no stake other than that of citizenship.

The ethnicity of the source is not a definitional consideration in distinguishing elite from non-elite sources. Hindman and Littlefield (1999) reported that while editors in more ethnically pluralistic communities include ethnic minorities in their lists of influential persons and new sources, these persons may nevertheless, be elite in the

community. Further, a comparison of two newspapers in Kansas (Massey, 1998) showed no real difference in source use practices during the 1986 presidential election, although one newspaper was considered by its editor to be a public journalism publication. Massey's study of the Topeka Capital Journal and the civic-oriented Wichita Eagle revealed no significant difference between the Eagle's use of non-elite sources and the Journal's when covering the 1986 presidential election. Massey found that the Eagles' use of non-elite sources (operationalized as citizen organizations and individuals with no institutional affiliation) decreased from its traditional reporting of the 1986 campaign to its civic reporting during the 1990 and 1994 campaigns.

Additionally, Domke (2000) theorized that, "journalists 'index' the voices and viewpoints in political news coverage to the range of perspectives found within the mainstream of government debate" (p. 116). Domke's study, which examines the political group's use of the media during and after legislation passed to abolish slavery, suggests that politicians and influential institutions used the media to advance their political agendas during that time. Domke's assertion, that usage of elite sources in news as early as the 18th and 19th centuries, establishes this practice as another norm of objective journalism. Communication research confirms elite sourcing as an established norm in mainstream and public journalism newspapers (Ericson, Baranek, & Chan, 1989; Tuchman, 1978).

Elite sources, regardless of where they stand on an issue, tend to reinforce and reify existing, prevalent societal beliefs and norms. The obvious problem with this assumption, or claim, lies in journalists' espoused duty to cover the entire community completely, fairly

and accurately. Public journalists contend that the practice of indexing elite sources remains a convention of traditional journalists. Massey (1998) asserts that civic journalism newspapers should employ more non-elite sources in their coverage. Additionally, the above noted studies, while utilizing newspapers in pluralistic communities, did not investigate media owned and operated by the ethnic community themselves.

Further studies of public-oriented ethnic newspaper practices are required. Public journalism, in theory, is a valuable resource for marginalized groups to enter the public debate. It is therefore useful to explore journalistic practices in a newspaper that is owned and operated within such a community. The Navajo Times, owned by the Navajo Nation, is such a publication. While the Gallup Independent serves a population that is 93 percent nonwhite and claims that two-thirds of employees are of minority descent, they are often seen as sensationalizing and making money off Navajo misery (All-white, 2004). The present research project will explore whether public journalists, as represented by an ethnic community newspaper medium, privilege non-elite over elite sources in lead articles. Elite sourcing is a concern that has a direct relationship to the question of who has access to the media, and what persons and groups can have their issues and views published.

Methods

The present project utilized a content analytic procedure that examined two newspapers, the Navajo Times and the Gallup Independent. Both newspapers are located in the Four Corners area, bordering Arizona and New Mexico. Geographically, the city of Gallup is bordered on all sides by Native American communities, in large part by the

Navajo Nation but also by the Hopi people and several Pueblos including Zuni and Laguna.

The Navajo Times is owned and operated by the Navajo Nation. The Gallup Independent covers approximately the same geographical area but is privately owned. Both newspapers cover the same news events to some extent. Some 52 issues of each paper, from January to December 2001 were studied. The Navajo Times is a weekly newspaper and the Gallup Independent is a daily newspaper. Therefore, the issue of the Gallup Independent that was utilized in the study was from the same day of the week on which the Navajo Times was published.

Quantitative content analysis is a research method that is used to identify, count, and analyze occurrences of messages and message characteristics within texts. Content analysis methodology was developed primarily for mass mediated messages (Frey, Botan, & Kreps, 2000; McQuail, 1994; Rubin & Perse, 1994) and is utilized regularly to analyze newspaper content (McLeod & Schuefele 1999; Perkins & Starosta, 2001). Content analysis, therefore, was an appropriate research methodology for the present study.

The advantages of utilizing content analysis as a research methodology were fourfold. First, it was an unobtrusive method that used already existing texts. Second, content selection for coding was based on the particular question that we wished to ask. Third, data appeared within the context for which it was originally produced; and fourth, a large amount of data was capable of being accessed. For the present study existing newspaper article texts were utilized from within the particular context of two local area newspaper publications, and coding categories were determined to answer specific

research questions regarding the use of elite sourcing within those newspapers.

Sample. A purposive sample, one year of lead articles from the two newspapers, provided the texts for the content analysis. These articles were obtained from microfilm files at the University of New Mexico, Zimmerman Library. One article from each of the 52 issues of the Navajo Times coincided with one article from the newspaper of the same day of the Gallup Independent. The item selected was the lead article from each issue, defined by the boldest headline on the front page. This provided a total of 104 items for analysis. For example: the March 8, 2001 article from the Gallup Independent is one that was placed first on the page next to a photograph and reads "Tribal panel reviewing water rights". Three articles were deleted from the sample; one because the newspaper misprinted the jump page; one because there was no Thanksgiving issue for the Navajo Times; and one because it would not print legibly from microfilm. The final number of items for analysis was 101.

The units of analysis were two types of manifest content. One type was referential units (Frey, Botan, & Kreps, 2000), to measure the elite or non-elite status of a quoted source. An example of elite source would be the president of the tribal council, whereas a non-elite source would be someone referred to only as a community member. The second type was a physical unit (Frey, Botan, & Kreps, 2000) to measure whether the source is quoted on the front or on a jump page (a page on which the article is continued from the front page). Analysis of the content unit types consisted of three content categories, utilizing a coding scheme modified from one developed by Perkins and Starosta (2001) for elite and non-elite

sources: a) who is quoted? Elite/Non-elite; b) who is/is not given credence of title? Generic/Non-Generic; c) where are those cited sources positioned within the news article? First page/jump.

Coding. We initially tested the coding scheme (Appendix A) in order to train the coders for reliability in their subsequent task. The following terms were clarified following testing: *Quoted* is the use of quotation marks or the use of the term(s) such as said, stated or according to, that denote active engagement as a source for the article. *Elite* is a person who has political or economic power. *Non-elite* is a citizen not involved in the governmental process, or who has no stake other than those of a citizen. *Generic title* generalizes to a group or does not name the person attached to the title. *Non-generic title* is linked to authority and/or which attaches a name to a specific title. Other items noted were that each source was to be coded only once and entities (organizations or collective voices) were to be considered generic. The notes section for each source was to be used to reference a name or a generic title used in order for accuracy to be double-checked.

Subsequent to clarification of the coding definitions two coders were trained. Some 20 percent of the articles, the first 10 articles from each newspaper, were selected for coding so that inter-coder reliability could be established. Overall inter-coder reliability was assessed utilizing Cohen's Kappa, and reliability was established between Coder One and Coder Two at 86 percent (n=6). This was higher than the 80 percent that is an acceptable level for most content analysis situations (Lombard, Snyder-Duch & Bracken, 2002).

Individual reliability for Elite/Non-elite source was assessed utilizing Cohen's Kappa, and reliability was established

between Coder One and Coder Two at 83 percent (n=6). Individual reliability for generic/non-generic title was assessed utilizing Cohen's Kappa, and reliability was not established. It was unreliable at 67 percent (n=6)ⁱ. This item was discarded and Hypothesis 3 could not be tested. Individual reliability for Front/jump page placement was assessed utilizing Cohen's Kappa, and reliability was established between Coder One and Coder Two at 86 percent (n=6).

Subsequent to establishing reliability on these items the remaining articles were divided between the two coders to complete the coding process. A total of 540 items were coded (N=540). There were 305 items for the Navajo Times and 235 items for the Gallup Independent.

Data-Analysis. The independent variable for analysis of Hypothesis 1 was the discrete variable of the two newspapers, either the Navajo Times or the Gallup Independent. The dependent variable was *source of quote*. The independent variable for Hypothesis 2 was the discrete variable of *placement* and the dependent variable was *source of quote*, also discrete. Quantifying the number of units in this way informed us of how often these types of messages were being communicated. The data were also used to describe, understand and critique the use of elite or non-elite sourcing in these newspapers. Both the independent and the dependent variable were discrete; therefore analysis was performed using a 2x2 Chi-square.

Findings

Hypothesis 1 stated: Ethnic publications will provide more source quotes from non-elite sources than traditional newspaper publications. Elite and non-elite sourcing was tested against the type of newspaper (Table 1) to determine if there was

a significant difference between the use of sources in the Navajo Times and the Gallup Independent newspaper publications. Quote source was the dependent variable. Significance was determined at a critical value of .05 with one degree of freedom. The Navajo Times, as an ethnic newspaper publication, provided more source quotes from non-elite sources than the Gallup Independent, a traditional newspaper publication. The Pearson Chi-square value of 15.72 at the 5 percent level is more than the tabular Chi-square value of 3.84 required for significance. Hypothesis 1 was supported.

[Put Table 1 about here]

Hypothesis 2 stated: Ethnic publications will position more non-elite sources on the front page of newspaper articles than will traditional newspaper publications. For Hypothesis 2 each type of source (elite and non-elite) was tested against positioning in the article (front or jump page). Position in the article was the independent variable and quote source was the dependent variable. Data were tested utilizing a separate Chi-square for each newspaper (Tables 2 and 3) and then compared deductively by the researchers. Significance for each Chi-square was determined at a critical value of .05 with one degree of freedom.

While the Navajo Times used more non-elite sources, as explained in Hypothesis 1, and there was a significant difference in placement on front or jump page (X^2 is 8.81, which is more than the X^2 of 3.84 with one degree of freedom). Even though the Navajo Times places a higher percentage of non-elite sources on the front page than did the Gallup Independent, the significance in the above Chi-square finding for placement was opposite of that expected. Some 81 percent of the non-elite sources were placed on the jump page, compared to an expected of 66

percent (Table 2). There was no significant difference for placement in the Gallup Independent (Table 3) (X^2 is 2.13, which is less than the X^2 of 3.84 with one degree of freedom ($p=ns$)). Hypothesis 2 was not supported.

[Put Table 2 about here]

[Put Table 3 about here]

Discussion

The primary objective for the present study was to investigate whether public journalism (in this case ethnic newspaper publications) offer an alternative public forum for the voices of marginalized groups. The findings support the researchers' hypothesis that ethnic publications use more quotes from non-elite sources; and to some degree place more non-elite sources on the front page of newspaper publications, than traditional newspapers. Additionally, two central concepts of public journalism; quote sourcing and positioning of quotes within a newspaper article, were explored.

Quote sourcing was central to the study since direct quotation in print news stories can be effective in swaying reader's opinions to one side of an issue. Elite sources, regardless of where they stand on an issue, tend to reinforce and reify existing, prevalent societal beliefs and norms. Public journalism has been suggested as an alternative to traditional journalism for the voice of marginalized groups, however past research has revealed no significant difference between use of elite and non-elite sources in public journalism publications. The researchers believed that ethnic press as a specialized form of public journalism would use a greater number of non-elite sources than a traditional newspaper publication. Findings from the present study confirmed this relationship.

Quote positioning within a front page newspaper article was the second central concept of the present study. The researchers believed that ethnic press would position more non-elite sources on the front page than a traditional newspaper publication. In comparing Chi-square values, the difference between placements of elite or non-elite sources on the front or jump page, between each newspaper this relationship was not confirmed. Even though the Navajo Times used a higher percentage of non-elite quotes than did the Gallup Independent, they placed a significantly higher number of non-elite sources on the jump page rather than the front page of newspaper articles.

Limitations

The major limitation of the present research was the inability to generalize beyond the two newspaper publications utilized. Only one ethnic publication was compared with one traditional newspaper publication. The results cannot therefore be generalized beyond these publications.

Implications

The present study has a number of theoretical, methodological, and practical implications. Public journalism is a relatively new area of study and there is a great deal of debate around definitions of concepts within the field. The results of comparing an ethnic publication to a traditional newspaper publication serving the same geographic area, offers some valuable information regarding these definitions. The importance of the concept of elite source indexing in distinguishing a traditional newspaper publication from one that can be considered to serve the interests of the community, rather than the publisher, is confirmed. However, the fact remains that both publications continue to use a higher number of elite than non-elite sources in their stories and that the

Navajo Times places a far higher number, than expected, of non-elite sources in the jump pages. In addition, the definition of a non-elite source needs to be further defined by analyzing the monetary or political power of the source within the community. The present study was unable to accomplish this goal.

Future research is also necessary to generalize beyond these two publications. There are a number of Native American and First Nation publications in both the United States and Canada that would offer an opportunity to generalize to First Nation publications in North America. Therefore, several ethnic newspaper publications need to be tested against a variety of similar traditional newspaper publications.

Methodologically future research would be helpful to further refine a content analysis coding scheme to measure more accurately the concept of elite and non-elite. Primarily in regards to the above mentioned concept of political or monetary power. Additionally, it is suggested that a more in depth study utilize the full coding scheme of Perkins and Starosta (2001) that also codes for whose ideas are supported/questioned, and which details are included or excluded. The scope of the present study did not allow for the measurement of those concepts.

It is hoped that the present study will help to inform publishers, editors, and journalists of Native American and other ethnic newspaper publications of the need to attend to who is quoted as sources for stories. Wheelock (1995) posited that a major goal of Native American owned media is the contribution to the ability of Native American tribes to achieve self-determination. Information that contributes to the attainment of this goal may be valuable for those involved. Similarly, such information may be

valuable to all those who are interested in increasing space in the public sphere for marginalized voices.

Works Cited

- Adebanwi, Wale. "The press and the politics of marginal voices: narratives of the experiences of the Ogoni of Nigeria." Media, Culture & Society 26.6 (2004): 763-83.
- Blom, Daniel A. "Public journalism, social capital, and quality management." National Civic Review 93.3 (2004): 43-9.
- Campbell, Cole C. "Journalism and public knowledge." National Civic Review 93.3 (2004): 3-11.
- Chaffee, Steven H. & Stacy F. Kanihan. "Learning about politics from the mass media." Political Communication 14 (1997): 421-30.
- Corrigan, Don H. The public journalism movement in America: Evangelists in the newsroom. Westport, CT: Praeger, 1999.
- "Covering Native Americans in the 21st Century." 2005. Western Knight Center for Specialized Journalism. 26 June 2008. <http://www.wkconline.org/index.php/seminars/speakerpage?sid=1246&seminarid=82>
- Domke, David. "Strategic elite, the press, and race relations." Journal of Communication 50.1 (2000): 115-35.
- Ericson, Richard V., Patricia M. Baranek, & Janet B. L. Chan. Negotiating control: A study of news sources. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1989.
- Evelio B. Javier Foundation. Connection with communities: A sourcebook on public journalism. Quezon City, Phillipines: Evelio B. Javier Foundation, 2002.
- Ewart, Jacqui. "Including women in the news: Does public journalism address the gender imbalance in the news sources used by journalists?" Australian Studies in Journalism Annual 12 (2003): 213-26.
- Frey, Lawrence R., Botan, Carl H., & Kreps, Gary L. Investigating communication: An introduction to research methods. Needham Heights, MA: Allyn & Bacon, 2000.
- Gender no longer a barrier to media hiring, but minority status may be. Media Report to Women 28, Spring 2000: 1.
- Gramsci, Antonio. Selections from prison notebooks. Trans. Quintin Hoare & Geoffrey Nowell-Smith. New York: International, 1971.
- Hall, Stuart. "Ideology." International Encyclopedia of Communications 2. Ed. Erik Barnouw. New York: Oxford University Press, 1989: 307-11.
- Haas, Tanni & Linda Steiner. "Public journalism as a journalism of publics." Journalism 2.2 (2001): 123-47.
- Habermas, Jurgen. The structural transformation of the public sphere: An inquiry into a category of Bourgeois society. Trans. Thomas Burger. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1989.
- Hindman, Douglas B. and Littlefield, Robert. "Structural pluralism, ethnic pluralism, and community newspaper." Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly, 76.2 (1999): 250-63.
- Kaniss, Phyllis. Making local news. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1991.
- Kenix, Linda Jean. "A comparison of environmental pollution coverage in the mainstream, African American, and other alternative press." The Howard Journal of Communication 16 (2005): 49-70.
- Kessler, Lauren. The dissident press: Alternative journalism in American history. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage, 1984.

- LaFever, Marcella A. "Relational dimensions of intercultural communication for public dialogue and decision-making: A case study of modern day treaty negotiation in British Columbia." Diss. University of New Mexico, 2005.
- Lambeth, Edmund B. "Journalism as a democratic practice." Assessing public journalism. Eds. Edmund B. Lambeth, Philip E. Meyer & Esther Thorsom. Columbia, MO: University of Missouri Press, 1998: 15-35.
- Littlefield, Daniel F. Jr., & Parins, James W. American Indian and Alaskan native newspapers and periodicals: 1826-1924. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1984.
- Littlejohn, Stephen W. Theories of human communication. (6th Ed.). Belmont, CA: Wadsworth, 1999.
- Lombard, Matthew, Jennifer Snyder-Duch, & Cheryl C. Bracken. "Content analysis in mass communication: Assessment and reporting of intercoder reliability." Human Communication Research, 28.4 (2002): 587-604.
- Massey, Brian L. "Civic journalism and non-elite sourcing: Making routine news work of community connectedness." Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly, 75.2 (1998): 394-407.
- Mayer, Michael E., William B. Gudykunst, Norman K. Perrill, & Bruce D. Merrill. "A comparison of competing models of the news diffusion process." Western Journal of Speech Communication 54.1 (1990):113-23.
- McGregor, Judy, Susan Fountaine, and Margie Comrie. "From contest to content: The impact of public journalism on New Zealand election campaign coverage." Political Communication, 17. 2000: 133-48.
- McLeod, Jack M., Dietram A. Schuefele. "Community, communication, and participation: The role of mass media and interpersonal discussion in local political participation." Political Communication 16 (1999): 315-36.
- McDevitt, Michael. "In defense of autonomy: A critique of public journalism critique." Journal of Communication 53 (2003): 155-64.
- McGill, Lawrence T. Newsroom diversity: Meeting the challenge. Arlington, VA: Freedom Forum, 2000.
- McQuail, Dennis. Mass communication theory: An introduction (3rd ed.). London, UK: Sage, 1994.
- Merritt and McMasters debate public journalism. Journal of Mass Media Ethics, 11.3 (1996): 173-83.
- Miller, Autumn and Susan Dente Ross. "They are not us: Framing of American Indians by the Boston Globe." The Howard Journal of Communication 15 (2004): 245-59.
- Murphy, James E. & Sharon M. Murphy. Let my people know: American Indian journalism, 1828-1978. Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press, 1981.
- "Navajo Times contact information." Arizona Newspapers Association. 2007. 26 June 2008. <<http://www.ananews.com/directory/members.htm#67>>
- Pan, Zhongdang & Gerald Kosicki "Framing as a strategic action in public deliberation." Framing public life: Perspectives on media and our understanding of the social world. Eds. Stephen D. Reese, Oscar H. Gandy, Jr. & August E. Grant.

- Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 2001: 35-66
- Perkins, Daniel J. & William J. Starosta. "Representing cocultures: On form and news portrayals of Native Americans." Howard Journal of Communications 12 (2001): 73-84.
- Prince, Richard. "All-white newsrooms listed." 12 May 2004. 26 June 2008 <http://www.maynardije.org/columns/dickprince/040512_prince/printable/>
- Rogers, Everett M. & Nancy Seidel. "Diffusion of news of the terrorist attacks of September 11, 2001." Prometheus 20.3 (2002). 209-19.
- Rosen, Jay. What are journalists for? New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1999.
- Rubin, Alan M. & Elizabeth M. Perse. "Measures of mass communication." Communication research measures: A sourcebook. Eds. Rebecca B. Rubin, Philip Palmgren, & Howard E. Sypher. New York: Guilford Press, 1994: 37-56
- Schudson, Michael. "The Emergence of the Objectivity Norm in American Journalism" Eds. Michael Hechter and Karl-Dieter Opp, Social Norms. New York: Russell Sage Foundation, 2001: 165-85.
- Trahant, Mark N. "Native American newspapers: Telling uncomfortable truths in tribal journalism." Summer 2000. 26 June 2008 <<http://www.freedomforum.org/publications/msj/courage.summer2000/t07.html>>
- Tuchman, Gaye. Making news: A study in the construction of reality. New York: Free Press, 1978.
- Voakes, Paul S. "A brief history of public journalism." National Civic Review 93 (2004): 25-36.
- Wasserman, Herman and Arnold de Beer "Which public? Whose interest? The South African media and its role during the first ten years of democracy." Criticalarts 19 (2005): 36-51.
- Weston, Mary A. Native Americans in the news. Westport, CT: Greenwood, 1996.
- Wheelock, Richard M. "Indian self-determination: Implications for tribal communications policies." Diss. University of New Mexico, 1995.
- Zubric, Stephen J. & R. Lance Holbert. "A comparative analysis: Objective & public journalism techniques." Newspaper Research Journal 21.4 (2000): 50-67.

Table 1 Elite and Non-Elite Sourcing by Type of Newspaper for 540 Sources in Two Newspapers

	Elite Sourcing	Non-Elite Sourcing	Totals
Navajo Times	241	64	305
Gallup Independent	215	20	235
Totals	<u>456</u>	<u>84</u>	<u>540</u>

X^2 is 15.72, which is more than the X^2 of 3.84 with one degree of freedom.

Table 2 Elite and Non-Elite Sourcing by Position in the Navajo Times

Position	Elite Sourcing	Non-Elite Sourcing	Totals
Front Page	93	12	105
Jump Page	148	52	200
Totals	<u>241</u>	<u>64</u>	<u>305</u>

X^2 is 8.81, which is more than the X^2 of 3.84 with one degree of freedom.

Table 3 Elite and Non-Elite Sourcing by Position in the Gallup Independent

Position	Elite Sourcing	Non-Elite Sourcing	Totals
Front Page	112	7	119
Jump Page	103	13	116
Totals	<u>215</u>	<u>20</u>	<u>235</u>

X^2 is 2.13, which is less than the X^2 of 3.84 with one degree of freedom ($p=ns$).

ⁱ The coders were unavailable for retraining on this item.